Writer: Reader:

What is the thesis? Paraphrase it in your own words below.

Does the thesis fit what the prompt asks for? Y/N Why or why not?

Who is the intended audience? ______ Does the author clearly/directly identify this audience in the paper, or is it just implied? Where could they be more direct?

Is this audience a specific local group? How could the writer be more specific?

What does this audience know about the topic? How do they think/feel about it?

Does the author use rhetorical strategies effectively based on that audience's knowledge and opinion on this topic? If so, what specific rhetorical strategies are used and how do they fit the audience? How might the writer more effectively speak to this particular audience?

What is the organizational strategy? (It might be cause/effect, problem/solution, pro/con, etc.). How could the structure of the essay be clearer/stronger?

Does the author include at least one of the following sources? List each below

- 1 work of protest art: _____
- 1 local, digitized source _____

[This file is supplemental material to Draxler, Designing Publicly Engaged First-Year Research Projects, prompt 5.1 (2021), doi: 10.31719/pjaw.v5i1.74]

- 1 popular source _____
- 1 peer reviewed, scholarly source or government document _____
- Evidence from the writer's own experiences ______

How is the author's argument "in conversation" with the other chosen writers? Which sources does the author agree/disagree with--or agree/disagree with qualifications?

Is each source in a separate paragraph (5 paragraph essay style), or does the author SYNTHESIZE them together? Explain.

Where does the essay need more evidence to be convincing? Which type of evidence would be most appropriate in that section (data, stories, analogy, example, other)?

Look at the direct quotations. Do they all have an in-text citation, a signal phrase and an explanation? Mark places where anything is missing.

Make an after-the-fact outline of the draft. Does each paragraph build cumulatively toward a central argument? Does it feel like a 5 paragraph essay or a thesis with a "list"? Are any paragraphs redundant? Do any not fit?

- a. Paragraph 1:
- b. Paragraph 2:
- c. Paragraph 3:
- d. Paragraph 4:
- e. Paragraph 5:
- f. Paragraph 6:
- g. Paragraph 7:
- h. Paragraph 8:

What is the call to action?

Is the call to action meaningful--that is, will it make a difference? Y/N

Is the call to action achievable--that is, can the chosen audience actually do it? Y/N

Where do you notice run ons or fragments? copy/paste them here.

Where do you notice vague language? copy/paste examples here.

Where do you notice wordiness? copy/paste examples here.

Any final advice for the writer?